

TABLE OF CONTENTS

The Catholic Church and Vatican City State: Due Process on Trial	1
PART I	
The Violation of the Principles of Penal Legality and Due Process in Canon Law. What Are the Legal Ramifications in Italian Law?	3
Introduction	3
CHAPTER I	
The derogation from the non-retroactivity of penal law, the <i>favor rei</i> , and prescription in canon law: the <i>ius Ecclesiae</i> put to the test	9
1. Dignity of the human person and the principle of legality. The guarantee-based structure of penal law in the Church.....	9
2. The right to exercise a criminal action and the overall integrity of the penal justice system. Critical notes on the right of the Dicastery for the Doctrine of the Faith to derogate from prescription.....	20
2.1. The rationale for the juridic institute of prescription and its substantive nature	20
2.2. Necessary contextualisation: the troubled path of canonical penal law, from post- conciliar illusions to the contemporary era of “zero tolerance”	25

2.3. The right “to derogate from prescription” in doctrinal reflection. Between violation of acquired rights and systematic inconsistencies.....	35
2.4. ... and proposed solutions and alternative remedies. In particular, administrative disciplinary measures.....	43
2.5. Teleological perspectives on the right to derogate from prescription. The link between the imprescriptibility of the offence and the purpose of canonical punishment	48
3. Procedural implications of the principle of penal legality with particular reference to the joinder of issue (<i>contestatio litis</i>). Reflections on the correct drafting of the formula of the doubt (<i>formula dubii</i>).	54

CHAPTER II

The fair criminal trial in secular legal systems, particularly in Italy: recent developments in the face of certain questionable practices in canon law	71
1. The fundamental rights at stake from the point of view of the Italian legal system: the “absolute” protection of the non-retroactivity of unfavourable penal law and the relevance of retroactivity <i>in mitius</i>	71
2. The guarantees underlying the institute of prescription and its direct connection with the principle of legality	81
3. In the footsteps of the most recent case law of the Constitutional Court: an increasingly evident sacrifice of constitutionally guaranteed rights.....	85
4. (<i>continued</i>) From the discretion of the authority to the retroactivity of the new criminalisation: the radical disregard for the guarantees of the accused	91

CHAPTER III

Intersections and overlaps between legal orders: between confessional autonomy and the protection of constitutionally guaranteed rights	97
1. Italian State authority and the exercise of the Catholic Church's jurisdictional power in the inviolable "distinction of orders"	97
2. The path toward alignment with the Constitutional Charter of theoretically and practically incompatible approaches. The Holy See's adherence to a fully shared normative framework	100
3. The right of defense and the right to a fair trial as "rights constitutionally guaranteed to Italian citizens"	107
4. On compensation for damages suffered in an unjust canonical penal procedure	113
5. A salutary warning	124

PART II

The "Becciu Trial." A Critical Analysis	127
Preliminary note by Geraldina Boni.....	127

CHAPTER I

<i>The Vatican legal system and canon law</i>	
A forgotten and mistreated guest: the "canonical order" as the first normative source and first criterion of interpretation.....	129
1. The principles of "due process" in the Vatican legal system. The influence of the divine natural law and the convergence with supranational systems for the protection of fundamental rights	129

2. The Vatican penal process put to the test. Anomalies and critical issues arising from the four *Rescripta ex audientia Sanctissimi* of Pope Francis..... 145
 - 2.1. Considerations on procedural legality, the right of defense (*ius defensionis*), and the principle of equality 152
 - 2.2. Rescripts as juridic acts of the Roman Pontiff. Implications of the principle *Prima Sedes a nemine iudicatur* in Vatican law..... 167
3. The *correct* understanding of the primacy of the successor of Peter in the canonical system and in the state system. The implosion of Vatican City State?..... 173

CHAPTER II

Parallel to the trial

- The signing of the Monetary Agreement and its consequences for Vatican City State 183
1. The end of the isolation of Vatican City State 183
 2. The signing of the Monetary Agreement and Vatican City State as a state governed by the rule of law: a trial between the Joint Committee and the European Court of Justice 186
 3. Structural features of the Vatican judicial system and principles of due process. A critical look at recent reforms and their impact on pending penal proceedings 209
 - 3.1. The independence of the judiciary and the principle of the predetermination (or immutability) of the judge 209
 - 3.2. Papal appointments and the sustainability of the judicial system: between the demands of justice and arguments of expediency 226

CHAPTER III

In the immediate aftermath of the trial

Vatican justice under the microscope of the European Court of Human Rights.....	241
1. Scrutiny of the sentence in Italy	241
2. The scrutiny before the European Court of Human Rights	252
3. From the scrutiny of the trial in question to that of Vatican justice in general	263

CHAPTER IV

In the very near future

The repercussions on the international credibility of the Holy See: the end of the Vatican court's reliability in relation to contracts and economic and financial controls	269
1. The assessment of the Vatican court's trustworthiness and its possible compromise	269
2. Public contracts in the pope's state and the Vatican forum clause: a crisis waiting to happen	277
3. The potential implications for economic and financial oversight: between Moneyval's supervision and European anti-money laundering legislation.....	286
What are the trajectories of Vatican justice?	293